

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

- - -

PHILADELPHIA GAS COMMISSION

- - -

SWEARING IN OF BILL RUBIN TO THE GAS COMMISSION

- - -

April 9, 2024

10:06 a.m.

- - -

VIA ZOOM VIDEOCONFERENCING

- - -

BEFORE: ROYAL E. BROWN, Acting Chairman
MICHAEL DRISCOLL
EVAN URBANIA
CHRISTY BRADY, Controller
BILL RUBIN, Alternate
Commissioners

- - -

VERITEXT LEGAL SOLUTIONS
MID-ATLANTIC DIVISION

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

APPEARANCES:

JAMES C. KELLETT, ESQ.
Deputy City Solicitor
Counsel to Philadelphia Gas Commission

ANDRE C. DASENT, ESQ.
Counsel to Philadelphia Gas Works
COMMUNITY LEGAL SERVICES, INC.

BY: ROBERT W. BALLENGER, ESQ.
Counsel to Public Advocate
EARTHJUSTICE

BY: DEVIN McDOUGALL, ESQ.
CELINE BUSNELLI, Litigation Assistant
Counsel to POWER

PRESENT ON BEHALF OF PGC:

GEMELA N. McCLENDON, ESQ.
Executive Director
HEIDI L. WUSHINSKE, ESQ.
Hearing Examiner

ROSLYN BELL, ESQ.
Hearing Examiner
ANNA M. CORRADO ROWE
Senior Analyst

TIMOTHY MURTHA
Financial Analyst/Internal Auditor

(Continued on Page 3.)

1 PRESENT ON BEHALF OF PGW:

2

WILLIAM J. GALLAGHER

3 Vice President, Budget and Strategic
4 Development

4

JOSEPH R. HAWKINSON

5 Vice President, Field Operations

6 KELLY DeLUSSEY

7 Vice President, Operations, Resource Management,
8 and Personnel

8 STEPHEN SCHUMMER

9 Manager, Budget Reporting

9

CARITA COUNCIL

10 Senior Budget Analyst, Finance

11 MARY LYNN O'BOYLE

Administrative Assistant

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

(Continued on Page 4.)

24

1 PRESENT ON BEHALF OF THE PUBLIC:

2 CINTHIA IBARRA

3 ELAINE FULTZ

4 HARRISON MACE, Reclaim Philadelphia

5 IV

6 JAMIR HUBBARD

7 JULIE GREENBERG

8 KAREN MELTON

9 LINNEA BOND

10 MAT WRANOVICS

11 MITCH CHANIN, Reclaim Philadelphia

12 NADINE YOUNG

13 PAMELA DARVILLE, POWER Interfaith

14 PATRICIA LIBBEY

15 PETER FURCHT

16 RACHEL JACOBS

17 STEVE GREENSPAN, POWER CJJ

18 TAMMY MURPHY

19 TOM MacDONALD, WHYY

20
21
22
23
24

1 EXEC. DIR. McCLENDON: Chairman
2 Brown, you may begin the meeting.

3 ACTING CHAIRMAN BROWN: Thank you.
4 Good morning, everyone.

5 I understand that current state law
6 requires that the following announcements be
7 made at the beginning of every remote public
8 hearing as follows:

9 The Gas Commission meeting is
10 currently occurring remotely. We are using
11 Zoom to make the remote meeting possible.
12 It is anticipated that Gas Commission
13 meetings will return to in person upon
14 completion of the Commission's hearing room
15 at 1515 Arch Street.

16 Instructions for how the public may
17 participate in these meetings are included
18 in the public meeting notices and can be
19 found on the Gas Commission's website.

20 I would like to acknowledge the
21 presence of a quorum with the participation
22 of City Controller Brady, Councilmember
23 Driscoll, and Commissioner Urbania.

24 I would like to have the agenda read

1 and marked as Gas Commission Exhibit #1.

2 EXEC. DIR. McCLENDON: "The
3 Philadelphia Gas Commission will hold a
4 regular meeting on Tuesday, April 9, 2024,
5 at 10:00 a.m. via Zoom videoconferencing for
6 the purpose of considering:

7 1. The swearing in of Bill Rubin to
8 the Gas Commission;

9 2. The Philadelphia Gas Works'
10 Proposed Fiscal Year 2025 Capital Budget,
11 Forecast for Fiscal Years 2026 to 2030, and
12 Related Matters; and

13 3. Such other business as may
14 properly be brought before this Commission."

15 - - -

16 (Whereupon PGC Exhibit #1 was marked
17 for identification.)

18 - - -

19 ACTING CHAIRMAN BROWN: Thank you.

20 The first item on the agenda is the
21 swearing in of Bill Rubin, First Deputy
22 Controller, as designee for Controller
23 Brady.

24 Section 6, Paragraphs 2 and 3, of the

1 Management Agreement provide that the City
2 Controller shall be a member of the Gas
3 Commission during their incumbency and until
4 a successor has been elected and qualified.

5 The Controller is granted the
6 authority to designate a Deputy City
7 Controller to act for them on the Gas
8 Commission under Section 3-701 of the
9 Philadelphia Home Rule Charter. Controller
10 Brady has exercised this authority and
11 appointed Bill Rubin as her designee.

12 Mr. Rubin lives in the Northeast
13 section of Philadelphia with his wife,
14 Delores; his two grown children, Bill and
15 Nicole; and two granddaughters, Caroline and
16 Charlie.

17 He began his career in government as
18 a parking enforcement officer with the PPA
19 in 1987 and moved to the City Commissioners
20 Office in 1989 where he served until 2011
21 and rose to be the Supervisor of Elections.

22 In 2012 Mr. Rubin joined the City
23 Controller's Office as the Deputy Fraud
24 Director. In 2013 he was named the First

1 Deputy/Chief of Staff where he served until
2 2018.

3 In 2018 he moved to the Philadelphia
4 Pension Board, where he served as the Audit
5 Manager until leaving for his current
6 position, becoming the First Deputy/Chief of
7 Staff once again in 2023.

8 During his career Mr. Rubin served
9 for over ten years as the Parliamentarian
10 and Secretary/Treasurer for District Council
11 33, Local 696, and was also elected as an
12 employee representative to the Philadelphia
13 Board of Pensions, where he was elected the
14 Vice Chairman.

15 Mr. Rubin serves on the Pennsylvania
16 Association of Public Employees Retirement
17 System's Board, where he was the Treasurer
18 and now serves as the Vice President.

19 He has also been and is currently the
20 Controller's designee to the Philadelphia
21 Board of Pensions and the Philadelphia
22 Sinking Fund.

23 At this time I ask Mr. Rubin to raise
24 your hand and repeat after me so that you

1 can be officially sworn in as Alternate Gas
2 Commissioner for Commissioner Brady.

3 Repeat after me: I, state your
4 name...

5 MR. RUBIN: I, Bill Rubin...

6 ACTING CHAIRMAN BROWN: ...solemnly
7 swear that I will support...

8 MR. RUBIN: ...solemnly swear that I
9 will support...

10 ACTING CHAIRMAN BROWN: ...obey and
11 defend...

12 MR. RUBIN: ...obey and defend...

13 ACTING CHAIRMAN BROWN: ...the
14 Constitution of the United States...

15 MR. RUBIN: ...the Constitution of
16 the United States...

17 ACTING CHAIRMAN BROWN: ...the
18 Constitution of the Commonwealth of
19 Pennsylvania...

20 MR. RUBIN: ...the Constitution of
21 the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania...

22 ACTING CHAIRMAN BROWN: ...the
23 Philadelphia Home Rule Charter...

24 MR. RUBIN: ...the Philadelphia Home

1 Rule Charter...

2 ACTING CHAIRMAN BROWN: ...and that I
3 will discharge the duties of this office
4 with fidelity.

5 MR. RUBIN: ...and I will discharge
6 these duties of the office with fidelity.

7 ACTING CHAIRMAN BROWN: Okay.
8 Congratulations, Mr. Rubin.

9 ALT. COMMISSIONER RUBIN: Thank you.

10 ACTING CHAIRMAN BROWN: Would any
11 other Commissioners like to make a statement
12 at this time?

13 COMMISSIONER BRADY: Welcome,
14 Mr. Rubin.

15 COMMISSIONER URBANIA: Welcome
16 aboard, Mr. Rubin.

17 ALT. COMMISSIONER RUBIN: Thank you.

18 ACTING CHAIRMAN BROWN: Thank you,
19 everyone.

20 - - -

21 Reported by: Susan Marie Migatz, RMR, CRR

22 - - -

23

24

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

- - -

INDEX

- - -

PHILADELPHIA GAS COMMISSION EXHIBITS

NUMBER	DESCRIPTION	PAGE
Exhibit #1	Agenda	6

- - -

1	aboard 10:16	atlantic 1:24	capital 6:10
1 6:1,7,16 11:6	acknowledge 5:20	audit 8:4	career 7:17 8:8
10:00 6:5	act 7:7	auditor 2:19	carita 3:9
10:06 1:6	acting 1:10 5:3	authority 7:6 7:10	caroline 7:15
1515 5:15	6:19 9:6,10,13	b	celine 2:9
1987 7:19	9:17,22 10:2,7	ballenger 2:6	chairman 1:10
1989 7:20	10:10,18	becoming 8:6	5:1,3 6:19 8:14
2	administrative 3:11	began 7:17	9:6,10,13,17,22
2 6:9,24	advocate 2:7	beginning 5:7	10:2,7,10,18
2011 7:20	agenda 5:24	behalf 2:11 3:1	chanin 4:11
2012 7:22	6:20 11:6	4:1	charlie 7:16
2013 7:24	agreement 7:1	bell 2:15	charter 7:9
2018 8:2,3	alt 10:9,17	bill 1:4,12 6:7	9:23 10:1
2023 8:7	alternate 1:12	6:21 7:11,14	chief 8:1,6
2024 1:6 6:4	9:1	9:5	children 7:14
2025 6:10	analyst 2:17,19	board 8:4,13	christy 1:12
2026 6:11	3:10	8:17,21	cinthia 4:2
2030 6:11	andre 2:4	bond 4:9	city 2:3 5:22
3	anna 2:17	brady 1:12	7:1,6,19,22
3 2:22 6:13,24	announcements 5:6	5:22 6:23 7:10	cjj 4:17
3-701 7:8	anticipated 5:12	9:2 10:13	commission 1:2
33 8:11	appearances 2:1	brought 6:14	1:4 2:3 5:9,12
4	appointed 7:11	brown 1:10 5:2	6:1,3,8,14 7:3,8
4 3:23	april 1:6 6:4	5:3 6:19 9:6,10	11:4
6	arch 5:15	9:13,17,22	commission's 5:14,19
6 6:24 11:6	assistant 2:9	10:2,7,10,18	commissioner 5:23 9:2,2 10:9
696 8:11	3:11	budget 3:3,8,10	10:13,15,17
9	association 8:16	6:10	commissioners 1:13 7:19
9 1:6 6:4		business 6:13	10:11
a		busnelli 2:9	commonwealth 9:18,21
a.m. 1:6 6:5		c	
		c 2:2,4	

community 2:6	description	exec 5:1 6:2	granted 7:5
completion 5:14	11:5	executive 2:13	greenberg 4:7
congratulations 10:8	designate 7:6	exercised 7:10	greenspan 4:17
considering 6:6	designee 6:22 7:11 8:20	exhibit 6:1,16 11:6	grown 7:14
constitution 9:14,15,18,20	development 3:3	exhibits 11:4	h
continued 2:22 3:23	devin 2:8	f	hand 8:24
controller 1:12 5:22 6:22,22 7:2,5,7,9	dir 5:1 6:2	fidelity 10:4,6	harrison 4:4
controller's 7:23 8:20	director 2:13 7:24	field 3:5	hawkinson 3:4
corrado 2:17	discharge 10:3 10:5	finance 3:10	hearing 2:14,16 5:8,14
council 3:9 8:10	district 8:10	financial 2:19	heidi 2:14
councilmember 5:22	division 1:24	first 6:20,21 7:24 8:6	hold 6:3
counsel 2:3,5,7 2:9	driscoll 1:11 5:23	fiscal 6:10,11	home 7:9 9:23 9:24
crr 10:21	duties 10:3,6	following 5:6	hubbard 4:6
current 5:5 8:5	e	follows 5:8	i
currently 5:10 8:19	e 1:10	forecast 6:11	ibarra 4:2
d	earthjustice 2:8	found 5:19	identification 6:17
darville 4:13	elaine 4:3	fraud 7:23	included 5:17
dasent 2:4	elected 7:4 8:11 8:13	furtz 4:3	incumbency 7:3
defend 9:11,12	elections 7:21	fund 8:22	index 11:2
delores 7:14	employee 8:12	furcht 4:15	instructions 5:16
delussey 3:6	employees 8:16	g	interfaith 4:13
deputy 2:3 6:21 7:6,23 8:1,6	enforcement 7:18	gallagher 3:2	internal 2:19
	esq 2:2,4,6,8,12 2:14,15	gas 1:2,4 2:3,5 5:9,12,19 6:1,3 6:8,9 7:2,7 9:1 11:4	item 6:20
	evan 1:11	gemela 2:12	iv 4:5
	examiner 2:14 2:16	good 5:4	j
		government 7:17	j 3:2
		granddaughters 7:15	jacobs 4:16
			james 2:2

<p>jamir 4:6 joined 7:22 joseph 3:4 julie 4:7</p>	<p>mary 3:11 mat 4:10 matters 6:12 mcclendon 2:12 5:1 6:2 mcdougall 2:8 meeting 5:2,9 5:11,18 6:4 meetings 5:13 5:17 melton 4:8 member 7:2 michael 1:11 mid 1:24 migatz 10:21 mitch 4:11 morning 5:4 moved 7:19 8:3 murphy 4:18 murtha 2:18</p>	<p>office 7:20,23 10:3,6 officer 7:18 officially 9:1 okay 10:7 once 8:7 operations 3:5 3:6</p>	<p>7:13 8:3,12,20 8:21 9:23,24 11:4 position 8:6 possible 5:11 power 2:9 4:13 4:17 ppa 7:18 presence 5:21 present 2:11 3:1 4:1 president 3:3,5 3:6 8:18 properly 6:14 proposed 6:10 provide 7:1 public 2:7 4:1 5:7,16,18 8:16 purpose 6:6</p>
<p>k</p>		<p>p</p>	
<p>karen 4:8 kellett 2:2 kelly 3:6</p>			
<p>l</p>		<p>page 2:22 3:23 11:5 pamela 4:13 paragraphs 6:24 parking 7:18 parliamentari... 8:9 participate 5:17 participation 5:21 patricia 4:14 pennsylvania 8:15 9:19,21 pension 8:4 pensions 8:13 8:21 person 5:13 personnel 3:7 peter 4:15 pgc 2:11 6:16 pgw 3:1 philadelphia 1:2 2:3,5 4:4 4:11 6:3,9 7:9</p>	
<p>l 2:14 law 5:5 leaving 8:5 legal 1:23 2:6 libbey 4:14 linnaea 4:9 litigation 2:9 lives 7:12 local 8:11 lynn 3:11</p>			
<p>m</p>	<p>n</p>		<p>q</p>
<p>m 2:17 macdonald 4:19 mace 4:4 made 5:7 make 5:11 10:11 management 3:6 7:1 manager 3:8 8:5 marie 10:21 marked 6:1,16</p>	<p>n 2:12 nadine 4:12 name 9:4 named 7:24 nicole 7:15 northeast 7:12 notices 5:18 number 11:5</p>		<p>qualified 7:4 quorum 5:21</p>
	<p>o</p>		<p>r</p>
	<p>o'boyle 3:11 obey 9:10,12 occurring 5:10</p>		<p>r 3:4 rachel 4:16 raise 8:23 read 5:24 reclaim 4:4,11 regular 6:4 related 6:12 remote 5:7,11 remotely 5:10 repeat 8:24 9:3</p>

<p>reported 10:21 reporting 3:8 representative 8:12 requires 5:6 resource 3:6 retirement 8:16 return 5:13 rmr 10:21 robert 2:6 room 5:14 rose 7:21 roslyn 2:15 rowe 2:17 royal 1:10 rubin 1:4,12 6:7,21 7:11,12 7:22 8:8,15,23 9:5,5,8,12,15 9:20,24 10:5,8 10:9,14,16,17 rule 7:9 9:23 10:1</p>	<p>sinking 8:22 solemnly 9:6,8 solicitor 2:3 solutions 1:23 staff 8:1,7 state 5:5 9:3 statement 10:11 states 9:14,16 stephen 3:8 steve 4:17 strategic 3:3 street 5:15 successor 7:4 supervisor 7:21 support 9:7,9 susan 10:21 swear 9:7,8 swearing 1:4 6:7,21 sworn 9:1 system's 8:17</p>	<p>u</p> <p>under 7:8 understand 5:5 united 9:14,16 urbania 1:11 5:23 10:15 using 5:10</p>
		<p>v</p> <p>veritext 1:23 vice 3:3,5,6 8:14,18 videoconfere... 1:8 6:5</p>
		<p>w</p> <p>w 2:6 website 5:19 welcome 10:13 10:15 why 4:19 wife 7:13 william 3:2 works 2:5 6:9 wranovics 4:10 wushinske 2:14</p>
<p>s</p> <p>schummer 3:8 secretary 8:10 section 6:24 7:8 7:13 senior 2:17 3:10 served 7:20 8:1 8:4,8 serves 8:15,18 services 2:6</p>	<p>t</p> <p>tammy 4:18 ten 8:9 thank 5:3 6:19 10:9,17,18 time 8:23 10:12 timothy 2:18 tom 4:19 treasurer 8:10 8:17 tuesday 6:4 two 7:14,15</p>	<p>y</p> <p>year 6:10 years 6:11 8:9 young 4:12</p>
		<p>z</p> <p>zoom 1:8 5:11 6:5</p>